STATE OF CALIFORNIA AGRICULTURAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD

BOARD MEETING MINUTES WORKING MINUTES

Employment Development Department Auditorium 722 Capitol Mall Sacramento CA 95814

January 12, 2017

Time: 2:00 p.m.

Members Present: Chairman Gould, Members Shiroma and Rivera-Hernandez
Staff Present: Executive Secretary Barbosa, Board Counsel Heyck, Inciardi and

Ratshin; Special Legal Advisor Blanco; Analyst Cooper

Others Present: ALRB: General Counsel Montgomery; Deputy General Counsel

Shawver; Regional Directors Herrera and Schneider; Chief of

Administration Rodrigues

OPEN SESSION

1. Approval of Minutes: Board approved 3-0 the minutes of June 30, 2016.

2. Public Comment: No members of the public were in attendance.

3. Chairman's Report:

On October 3, 2016, the Agricultural Labor Relations Board (ALRB or Board) appointed Kristine M. Rodrigues to serve as the Chief for the Division of Administrative Services. Ms. Rodrigues has over 25 years in the human resource and labor relations discipline within State civil service. Immediately prior to her appointment, Ms. Rodrigues worked as the Special Assistant to the Undersecretary of Administration and Offender Services at the Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation. She was the Assistant Deputy Director, Labor and Human Resource Management at CAL FIRE from 2011 to 2015. In 2005 – 2011, then Governor Schwarzenegger appointed Ms. Rodrigues as a Principal Labor Relations Officer negotiating the most sensitive and politically charged labor agreements. Ms. Rodrigues brings with her vast knowledge of the state civil service system along with strong management best practices. Chairman Gould publicly welcomed Ms. Rodrigues to the ALRB, and on behalf of the Board, congratulated Ms. Rodrigues on her appointment as Chief.

On January 10, 2017, Governor Brown announced his proposed budget for Fiscal Year 2017-18. The ALRB's portion of the proposed budget is approximately \$9.767 million. The proposed budget includes permanent funding for the Board's current limited term Attorney IV position, and permanent funding for 1.5 current limited term Hearing Officer positions. The General Counsel and Administration programs remain the same.

On Friday, April 14, 2017, the ALRB and UC Davis will host the third farm labor conference at the Kalmanovitz Appellate Courtroom, UC Davis Law School at UC Davis. The 2015 conference examined the ALRA at 40. The 2016 conference focused on water, labor, and immigration. This conference will focus on 1) Sustainability Certification Standards and Farm Labor Compliance, 2) Farm Labor: Responding to Aging and Settling Workers, 3) Immigration and Farm Workers, and 4) ALRB Issues. Chairman William Gould, Board Member Genevieve Shiroma, ALRB staff and guest speakers will be participating.

Chairman Gould will be visiting the Imperial Valley at the end of January or beginning of February to get a first-hand sense of what it looks like when workers come across the border.

The Board approved a proposed worker education regulation in November 2015. In September 2016, the Labor and Workforce Development Agency approved the regulation package. Since then the Board has been working with Department of Finance to gain their approval so this package can be sent to Office of Administrative Law. The Chairman is hopeful that this regulation will soon move forward.

- **4. Regulations** Approval of E-Filing and Consolidation of Mirror Unfair Labor Practice Charges with Objections to Election Regulations. Proposed regulations, introduced in late spring 2016, on E-filing of documents with the ALRB and on the consolidation of election objections with "mirroring" ULP complaints have undergone public review. After counsel summarized comments received, and the resulting actions, the Chairman asked the Board to take a vote to adopt the language of each proposal.
 - **E-Filing Regulation:** After consideration of public comment received during the original written comment period expressing concern that if electronic service was made to a single email address, a filing might be inadvertently overlooked, misfiled or deleted, the notice of proposed rulemaking was revised to allow documents to be filed to no more than five email addresses. No further comments having been received following the 15-day notice of revision of the proposal, the

Board voted 3-0 to adopt the revised proposed regulation. The final rulemaking package will be submitted to the Office of Administrative Law (OAL) for final review and approval.

• Consolidation of Mirror Unfair Labor Practice Charges with Objections to Election Regulations: The notice of proposed rulemaking was submitted to OAL and published in their registry on April 8, 2016. The public comment period passed without any public comment. The Board voted 3-0 to adopt the regulation as proposed. The final rulemaking package will be submitted to OAL for final review and approval.

5. Executive Officer's Report on Elections, Unfair Labor Practice Complaints, Hearings and Court Litigation

ELECTION REPORT

Since the Board's last meeting in June 2016, there have been no new notices of intent to take access (NAs), no new notices of intent to organize (NO) and no new election petitions filed with the regional offices. There is also no pending or resolved election cases. There is one election case pending in the appellate courts. That case will be discussed as part of the litigation report.

COMPLAINT REPORT

Since the Board's last meeting, the General Counsel has issued eight (8) new complaints, re-instated one previously settled complaint, settled three (3) complaints prior to hearing and withdrawn two complaints.

NEW COMPLAINTS ISSUED

J. Lohr Vineyards, 2015-CE-022-SAL

General Counsel issued a complaint on June 30, 2016.

Konark Ranches, LLC - 2015-CE-048-VIS

General Counsel issued a complaint on June 30, 2016.

United Farm Workers of America (Angel Lopez), 2015-CL-006-VIS

General Counsel issued a complaint on June 30, 2016.

United Farm Workers of America (Jose Luis Magana), 2016-CL-004-SAL and 2016-CL-006-SAL.

General Counsel issued a complaint on August 17, 2016.

United Farm Workers of America (Sandra Olvera), 2016-CL-007-SAL.

General Counsel issued a complaint on August 17, 2016.

Ojai Farms, Inc., 2015-CE-041-SAL

General Counsel issued a complaint on August 26, 2016.

Airdrome Orchards, Inc., 2016-CE-002-VIS

General Counsel issued a complaint on December 30, 2016.

Pacific Ag Management, Inc., 2015-CE-043-VIS.

General Counsel issued a complaint on December 30, 2016.

RE-INSTATED ONE PREVIOUSLY SETTLED COMPLAINT

United Farm Workers of America (Olvera), 2013-CL-002-SAL

General Counsel re-instated complaint on September 21, 2016.

COMPLAINTS SETTLED PRIOR TO HEARING

Ojai Farms, Inc., 2015-CE-041-SAL

J. Lohr Vineyards, 2015-CE-022-SAL

Mushroom Farms, Inc., 2015-CE-051-SAL

COMPLAINTS WITHDRAWN

Gerawan Farming, Inc., 2015-CE-011-VIS & 2015-CE-012-VIS

Ojai Farms, Inc., 2015-CE-041-SAL

HEARINGS IN PROGRESS

None.

HEARINGS SCHEDULED

There are three hearings currently scheduled and two hearings that are pending scheduling. Two hearings are scheduled in February, i.e., Konark Ranches & UFW (Olvera/Magana). One hearing is scheduled in March, i.e., United Farm Workers (Angel Lopez). In addition, there are two cases that are pending scheduling, i.e., Airdrome Orchards and Pacific Ag Management.

Konark Ranches, LLC, 2015-CE-048-VIS

Hearing: February 28, 2017

United Farm Workers (Olvera/Magana), 2013-CL-002-SAL

Hearing: February 28, 2017

United Farm Workers of America (Angel Lopez), 2015-CL-006-VIS

Hearing: March 28, 2017

Airdrome Orchards, Inc., 2016-CE-002-VIS

Matter to be scheduled for hearing.

Pacific Ag Management, Inc., Case Number 2015-CE-043-VIS.

Matter to be scheduled for hearing.

HEARINGS HELD

Gerawan Farming, Inc., 2012-CE-041-VIS

Hearing held November 1 & 2, 2016.

CASES PENDING TRANSCRIPTS, POST-HEARING BRIEFS OR ALJ/IHE DECISION

Gerawan Farming, Inc., 2012-CE-041-VIS

Post-hearing briefs file December 16, 2016. The matter is pending an ALJ decision.

ALJ/IHE DECISIONS ISSUED

Premiere Raspberries, LLC dba Dutra Farms, 2016-CE-010-SAL

Decision issued August 22, 2016

T.T. Miyasaka Inc., 2016-CE-011-SAL

Decision issued August 22, 2016

CASES PENDING EXCEPTIONS OR REPLY/REQUEST FOR REVIEW None.

CASES PENDING BOARD DECISION OR ACTION

None.

CASES REFERRED TO COMPLIANCE

None.

COMPLIANCE CASES CLOSED

Bud Antle, Inc., 2012-CE-007-SAL, 39 ALRB No. 12

Closing letter issued October 19, 2016.

THE BOARD HAS ISSUED THREE BOARD DECISIONS and FOUR ADMINISTRATIVE ORDERS

BOARD DECISIONS ISSUED

Mushroom Farms, Inc., 2016-MMC-001

42 ALRB No. 3; Board decision issued August 17, 2016

Premiere Raspberries, LLC dba Dutra Farms, 2016-CE-010-SAL

42 ALRB No. 4; Board decision issued November 18, 2016

T.T. Miyasaka, Inc., 2016-CE-011-SAL

42 ALRB No. 5; Board decision issued November 18, 2016

ADMINISTRATIVE ORDERS

Gerawan Farming, Inc., 2012-CE-041-VIS, et al.

Order Directing Parties to Provide Information Regarding Alternate Hearing Dates Admin. Order 2016-10, July 7, 2016

Gerawan Farming, Inc., 2012-CE-041-VIS, et al.

Order Granting Stipulated Motion to Continue Prehearing Conference and Hearing Admin. Order 2016-11, July 14, 2016

Mushroom Farms, Inc., 2016-MMC-001

Order Denying Employer's Motion for Reconsideration Admin. Order 2016-12, September 7, 2016

Gerawan Farming, Inc., 2015-CE-011-VIS

Order Granting Respondent's Application for Special Permission to Appeal ALJ Order Denying Petition to Revoke Admin. Order 2016-13, November 8, 2016

MANDATORY MEDIATION AND CONCILIATION

On August 9, 2016, The United Food and Commercial Workers, Local 5 (UFCW), filed a petition seeking a referral to Mandatory Mediation and Conciliation (MMC) on August 9, 2016. On August 17, 2016, the Board issued a decision and order directing the Employer and UFCW to mandatory mediation and conciliation (MMC). The parties selected Matt Goldberg as the mediator and met for mediation on December 13, 2016. The parties are scheduled to meet again on January 20, 2016, for their second session. In the interim, the parties have agreed to investigate and collect additional data necessary to mediate contract articles that remain in dispute.

ALRB BOARD LITIGATION

Petitions for Writ of Review of Unfair Labor Practice Decisions

► Tri-Fanucchi Farms v. ALRB, California Supreme Court Case No. S227270

Summary: Petitions for review of the Fifth District Court of Appeal's decision affirming in part and reversing in part the Board's decision and order in 40 ALRB No. 4, in which the Board found the Employer committed unfair labor practices and awarded bargaining makewhole as a remedy. The appellate court upheld the Board's decision denying the Employer's abandonment defense, but set aside the Board's ruling as to the makewhole remedy.

Status: The matter is fully briefed and pending scheduling of oral argument.

► T.T. Miyasaka, Inc. v. ALRB, Sixth District Court of Appeal, Case No. H044198

Summary: Petition for writ of review of the Board's decision in 42 ALRB No. 5, in which the Board found the Employer unlawfully maintained an arbitration

agreement that employees reasonably could understand prohibited the filing of unfair labor practice charges in violation the Agricultural Labor Relations Act.

Status: The Board filed the certified record on January 11, 2017. The Employer's opening brief is due February 15, 2017, the Board's opposition brief is due March 22, 2017, and the Employer's reply brief will be due April 17, 2017.

► Magana v. ALRB (T.T. Miyasaka, Inc.), Sixth District Court of Appeal, Case No. H044175

Summary: Petition for writ of review of the Board's decision in 42 ALRB No. 4, in which the Board dismissed unfair labor practice allegations against the Employer claiming a class action waiver in the Employer's arbitration agreement violated the Agricultural Labor Relations Act.

Status: The Board filed the certified record on January 11, 2017. The Employee's opening brief is due February 15, 2017, the Board's opposition brief is due March 22, 2017, and the Employee's reply brief will be due April 17, 2017.

► Premiere Raspberries, LLC dba Dutra Farms v. ALRB, Sixth District Court of Appeal, Case No. H044197

Summary: Petition for writ of review of the Board's decision in 42 ALRB No. 5, in which the Board found the Employer unlawfully maintained an arbitration agreement that employees reasonably could understand prohibited the filing of unfair labor practice charges in violation the Agricultural Labor Relations Act.

Status: The Board filed the certified record on January 11, 2017. The Employer's opening brief is due February 15, 2017, the Board's opposition brief is due March 22, 2017, and the Employer's reply brief will be due April 17, 2017.

► Cruz v. ALRB (Premiere Raspberries, LLC dba Dutra Farms), Sixth District Court of Appeal, Case No. H044179

Summary: Petition for writ of review of the Board's decision in 42 ALRB No. 4, in which the Board dismissed unfair labor practice allegations against the Employer claiming a class action waiver in the Employer's arbitration agreement violated the Agricultural Labor Relations Act.

Status: The Board filed the certified record on January 11, 2017. The Employee's opening brief is due February 15, 2017, the Board's opposition brief is due March 22, 2017, and the Employee's reply brief will be due April 17, 2017.

► Sabor Farms, LLC v. ALRB, Sixth District Court of Appeal, Case No. H043618

Summary: Petition for writ of review of the Board's decision in 42 ALRB No. 2, in which the Board found the Employer unlawfully terminated two employees based on their protected concerted activity.

Status: Briefing is complete, and the parties are awaiting action by the court either dismissing the petition or granting review.

► Arnaudo Brothers v. ALRB, Fifth District Court of Appeal, Case No. F072420

Summary: Petition for writ of review of the Board's decision in 41 ALRB No. 6, in which the Board found the Employer committed unfair labor practices and awarded bargaining makewhole as a remedy.

Status: On July 11, 2016, the court issued a writ of review. The matter is pending scheduling of oral argument.

► United Farm Workers (Corralitos Farms, LLC) v. ALRB, Sixth District Court of Appeal, Case No. H041113

Summary: Petition for writ of review of the Board's decision in 40 ALRB No. 6, in which the Board found the Union unlawfully picketed for representative status.

Status: This matter is stayed by a July 24, 2015 order in a pending bankruptcy proceeding involving the Employer.

Mandatory Mediation and Conciliation Litigation

► Gerawan Farming, Inc. v. ALRB, California Supreme Court Case No. S227243

Summary: Petition for writ of review asserting various statutory and constitutional challenges to Board's decision in 39 ALRB No. 17, where the Board approved a mandatory mediation and conciliation contract between the Employer and Union.

Status: The matter is fully briefed and pending scheduling of oral argument.

► Gerawan Farming, Inc. and Lupe Garcia v. ALRB, et al., Fresno County Superior Court Case No 13-CECG-03374 [Fifth Appellate District Case Nos. F069896/F070287]

Summary: Employer's complaint for declaratory and injunctive relief alleging the Board's decision in 39 ALRB No. 13 unconstitutionally violates employees' First Amendment right of access to mandatory mediation and conciliation proceedings. An agricultural employee of the Employer intervened in the case alleging similar constitutional access claims.

Status: The appellate court issued its remittitur returning this case to the superior court on September 7, 2016. The Board defendants answered the Employer's complaint on September 16 and the Employee's complaint-in-intervention on October 3. The parties filed cross-summary judgment motions on January 11, 2017, and the court has set a hearing on those motions for March 22, 2017.

► Garcia v. ALRB, et al., Fresno County Superior Court, Case No. 13-CECG-01557

Summary: Agricultural employee's petition for writ of mandate seeking review of the Board's decision in 39 ALRB No. 5 ordering his Employer and Union to mandatory mediation and conciliation and challenging constitutionality of the mandatory medication and conciliation process.

Status: On September 24, 2014, the court granted the Board's request to stay all proceedings pending resolution of California Supreme Court Case No. S227243 involving the Employer's constitutional challenge to mandatory mediation and conciliation.

➤ Spawn Mate, Inc. dba Mushroom Farms v. ALRB, et al., Monterey County Superior Court, Case No. 16CV003804

Summary: Employer's complaint for injunctive relief to stay pending mandatory mediation and conciliation proceedings.

Status: The Employer filed a complaint and an ex parte application for a temporary restraining order on November 29, 2016. The court denied the request for a temporary restraining order, but set a hearing on an order to show cause re: preliminary injunction. That hearing was held on January 6, 2017, at which time the court denied the Employer's request for a preliminary injunction. The court set a trial date for July 31, 2017. The Board's responsive pleading is due February 13, 2017.

Other Board Litigation

► Lopez v. Shiroma, et al., U.S. Court of Appeals, Ninth Circuit, Case No. 14-16640 [U.S. District Court, E.D. Cal., Case No. 1:14-CV-00236-LJO-GSA]

Summary: Action under 42 U.S.C. § 1983 against various Board members and employees for alleged civil rights violations arising out of a representation election.

Status: On September 14, 2016, the Ninth Circuit issued an unpublished opinion dismissing plaintiff's First Amendment claims against the Board member and regional director defendants, finding they are entitled to qualified immunity. The matter was remanded to the district court, and the parties thereupon stipulated to a judgment and dismissal of the case.

► Cedar Point Nursery and Fowler Packing Co. v. Gould, et al., U.S. Court of Appeals, Ninth Circuit, Case No. 16-16321 [U.S. District Court, E.D. Cal., Case No. 1:16-CV-00185-LJO-BAM]

Summary: Complaint for injunctive and declaratory relief seeking an order to overturn the Board's access regulation (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 8, § 20900) on constitutional grounds under the Fourth and Fifth Amendments.

Status: The district court dismissed plaintiffs' Fourth and Fifth Amendment claims. Plaintiffs appealed. Plaintiffs filed their opening brief on December 5, 2016. The Board's answering brief is due February 3, 2017.

► Gerawan Farming, Inc. v. ALRB, Fifth District Court of Appeal, Case No. F073720

Summary: Petition for writ of review of the Board's decision in 42 ALRB No. 1, in which the Board dismissed a decertification petition, set aside a decertification election, and found the Employer committed unfair labor practices.

Status: The Employer filed its opening brief on September 28, 2016. The Board filed its opposition brief on December 2, 2016, and the Union filed a brief in opposition on December 5, 2016. The Employer's reply brief is due January 16, 2017.

► Lopez v. ALRB, Fifth District Court of Appeal, Case No. F073730

Summary: Petition for writ of mandate seeking review of the Board's decision in 42 ALRB No. 1, in which the Board dismissed a decertification petition, and set aside a November 2013 decertification election.

Status: Preliminary briefing by the parties, and supplemental briefing ordered by the court, is complete. On September 16, 2016, the court issued an order deferring further proceedings in this case pending resolution of the Employer's separate petition for writ of review in Case No. F073720.

► Gerawan Farming, Inc. v. ALRB, Fifth District Court of Appeal, Case No. F073769

Summary: Petition for writ of mandate seeking review of the Board's decision in 42 ALRB No. 1, in which the Board dismissed a decertification petition, and set aside a November 2013 decertification election.

Status: Preliminary briefing by the parties, and supplemental briefing ordered by the court, is complete. On September 16, 2016, the court issued an order deferring further proceedings in this case pending resolution of the Employer's separate petition for writ of review in Case No. F073720.

► Gerawan Farming, Inc. v. ALRB, Fifth District Court of Appeal, Case No. F074423 [Fresno County Superior Court, Case No. 16-CECG-00411]

Summary: Petition for writ of mandate to compel Board to reverse an administrative law judge's ruling revoking subpoenas served by the Employer in an unfair labor practice proceeding. The Board demurred to the petition on jurisdictional grounds, and the superior court sustained the demurrer and dismissed the case. The Employer appealed that ruling.

Status: On January 12, 2017, the court granted the parties' stipulated request for extensions of time to file briefs. The Employer's opening brief is due March 20, 2017. The Board's opposition brief is due June 19, 2017.

► Gerawan Farming, Inc. v. ALRB, Sacramento County Superior Court, Case No. 34-2015-80002100 [Third Appellate District, Case No. C081373]

Summary: Petition for writ of mandate under the California Public Records Act seeking to compel disclosure of communications between the Board and General Counsel relating to a decision to seek injunctive relief against the Employer. The superior court ordered the Board to produce the records. The Board filed a petition for writ of mandate in the Third Appellate District challenging the superior court's ruling. The appellate court issued a published opinion on October 25, 2016, granting the Board's petition for writ of mandate.

Status: On December 30, 2016, the appellate court issued its peremptory writ of mandate and remittitur returning this case to the Sacramento County Superior Court to vacate its prior judgment and to enter a new judgment.

► Alvarez v. ALRB, et al., Sacramento County Superior Court, Case No. 34-2015-00185535

Summary: Pauline Alvarez, a current ALRB employee with the Office of the General Counsel, filed a complaint for discrimination and harassment arising out her employment.

Status: The ALRB answered the complaint by general denial on January 22, 2016. The matter is in discovery.

6. General Counsel's Report – General Counsel Montgomery reported that since the Board's last meeting, the hearing was completed in Gerawan Farming, Inc., Case No. 2012-CE-041-VIS. Due to the hard work of the General Counsel Staff and working together collaboratively with the parties and their attorneys, stipulations were entered into and one of the charges was settled prior to hearing. Additionally, some Administrative Orders were issued which streamlined the hearing from five weeks down to two days. This was a huge accomplishment and a great savings of the resources for all. Ms. Montgomery was very pleased that the staff was able to accomplish that together with the parties and everyone was able to work together amicably. She hopes to continue to find ways to streamline cases and reach agreements with the parties.

A number of checks were distributed to San Joaquin Tomato Grower workers, which was very gratifying. The case has been around quite a long time. Two different distributions where held where workers came and received their checks. Additionally, staff members went out, sometimes to people's homes and various places, to deliver checks to workers.

More staff training is being instituted. A two-day training for new staff hired was implemented as well as monthly General Counsel Staff program training. The goal is to increase the knowledge and capacity of our staff.

The General Counsel has hired nine additional staff members since the last meeting. Although that many people were hired, a number of folks have also left. It continues to be a top goal of the General Counsel Program to fill these vacancies and do whatever we can to retain people, knowing that folks are always going to be moving on to some extent because of their own personal reasons or otherwise. Efforts are being made to fill the vacancies that exist and strengthen the staff through training and mentoring.

Among those hires, is a new Regional Director in Visalia, Chris Schneider, who started work on October 26. He is providing day-to-day leadership in Visalia and the

General Counsel is pleased to have a full-time onsite Regional Director.

Ms. Montgomery also welcomed Kristine Rodrigues to the ALRB and expressed her appreciation that the department has a full-time Chief Executive of Administration, and that it is an excellent addition to the ALRB program.

The General Counsel is reaching out to stakeholders, both in the agricultural community as well as farmworkers and unions. Ms. Montgomery wants to reach out to people, meet with them, listen to them, hear what their issues are, their concerns, and see how our staff can be more effective in addressing those concerns.

Ms. Montgomery has been talking to her staff about, and has spoken briefly with the Chairman and Executive Secretary about, finding ways to improve the ALRB website so that it can be more effective, a better conduit of information, and more useful for the public. The General Counsel will be continuing to communicate about that and provide ideas. Those range from clarifying that the ALRA and the ALRB protect all individuals, all of our stakeholders, regardless of immigration status, and that it protects all Californians who are subject of the jurisdiction of the Act. Additionally, she would like to improve the website design to be more accessible to people with limited English-speaking and reading and writing abilities. Also, she would like to give more updates and information about the General Counsel Program, in particular. Any ideas and suggestions will be appreciated.

7. Chief of Administration's Report – Ms. Rodrigues thanked the Board for the opportunity to serve as Chief for the Division of Administrative Services. Since her appointment in October, Ms. Rodrigues has enjoyed learning about the roles, responsibilities and functions of the Board and General Counsel programs. She looks forward to continuing to develop administrative efficiencies so that Board and General Counsel can focus on the work and the roles and responsibilities of their respective programs. Administration Team Reports were previously submitted to the Board and the Board had no questions.

8. Legislation

AB 12, Cooley. Introduced Dec. 5, 2016. State government: administrative regulations: review.

Existing law authorizes various state entities to adopt, amend, or repeal regulations for various specified purposes. The Administrative Procedure Act requires the Office of Administrative Law and a state agency proposing to adopt, amend, or

repeal a regulation to review the proposed changes for, among other things, consistency with existing state regulations.

This bill would require each state agency to, on or before January 1, 2020, review that agency's regulations, identify any regulations that are duplicative, overlapping, inconsistent, or out of date, to revise those identified regulations, as provided, and report to the Legislature and Governor, as specified. The bill would repeal these provisions on January 1, 2021.

9. Announcements

None.

The public meeting adjourned at 2:39 p.m.